Axes of resonance in music education:

An artographic exploration

Markus Tullberg[1] & Eva Sæther[2]

Lund University

Abstract

This article discusses the potentials of a/r/tography aka artography against the background of life in an accelerating academia that is increasingly shallow and unfulfilling, and where quality is only indirectly measured using bibliometrics. We find Hartmut Rosa's concept of resonance to be useful when discussing the values that get lost in such a system. We appreciate the arguments for a slower, deeper, and more collegial way of working. It is where the distractions of ordinary life intersect with the vision of a more profound, qualitative way of working that we make our arguments for an artographic way of being. However, we also identify challenges by drawing on experiences in our own working lives, and specifically our ongoing collaborative research project. Exploring options for navigating around the constraints, we suggest a "toolbox" for how the individual artographer can contribute to making academia a more resonant space.

Keywords: a/r/tography, artography, messy research, academia, slow research, slow professor

[1] markus.tullberg@mhm.lu.se

[2] eva.saether@mhm.lu.se

Intro

> Alienation, I want to claim, is a particular mode of relating to the world of things, to people, and to one's self in which there is no responsivity, i.e., no meaningful inner connection. It is a relationship without genuine relation. In this mode, there certainly are causal and instrumental connections and interactions, but the world (in all its qualities) cannot be appropriated by the subject, it cannot be made to "speak", *it appears to be without sound and color.* (Rosa, 2018, p. 1, our emphasis)

This article is a reflection on our first-hand experiences of working at full speed to produce measurable impact in a highly commodified research culture. As musicians, music educators, and researchers we have long sensed there is something missing, and that this something might be the essence of education, the precondition for knowledge to expand. To us, the commitments of a/r/tographic work (Irwin, 2013, p. 199) are at one with the modes of knowing integral to academic work, although any artographer will wrestle with structural resistance. In this article, we as aspiring artographers consider the potential of artographic work as creative pedagogy. As Heaton et al. (2020) argue, artography helps students establish a safe place from which to consider differences and find their own voices. By extension, working with artographic tools may help the individual navigate their academic, personal, and professional lives. Our focus is the teacher role when exhibiting artographic thinking and behaviour.

It was North American scholars who drove the development of early artography (Sinner, 2017). However, the literature's geographical representation stands to benefit significantly from this special issue of the *Nordic Journal of Art & Research*. Even though academia is increasingly globalised, there remain structural differences, and in this article, we offer an account of possibilities and constraints on artographic work specific to Sweden. Exchanging experiences in this way can only help in formulating strategies for sustainable academic working lives.

Describing modern society as mute, Hartmut Rosa (2018) sets out the grounds for finding the opposite to alienation: *resonance*. Resonance is a way of being in the world that highlights the significance of art. For us as music educators, we find it intriguing and encouraging that art and musical metaphors are often used in other disciplines, such as sociology (Rosa, 2018) and anthropology (Dissanayake 1992), or

in discussions of democracy or agency. Metaphors such as voice, harmony, dissonance, resonance, pulse, orchestration, in concert, and discord often find their way into academic literature, as scholars use music as a tool to expand knowledge in non-musical fields (Bjerstedt, 2021). In this article we elaborate on the results of such borrowing, using Rosa's concept of resonance (Rosa, 2018) to answer two key questions.[3]

> (*i*) What does Rosa's concept of resonance mean to us as aspiring artographers?
> (*ii*) How can resonance be sustained in academic settings?

In answering, we draw not only on our own experiences as researchers, teachers, and musicians, but also on the initial findings and methodological reflections from the ongoing research project Tradition, Identity, Learning (TIL), where we explore what is at stake in becoming a *spelman* or Swedish folk musician.[4] Using the theory of social acceleration (Rosa, 2015) as our conceptual framework, we were drawn to Swedish folk music and its learning arenas as our research topic because it resonates with us. This is resonance as the power to evoke, and something more than experiencing the quality of the soundworlds we inhabit with our respective instruments (Tullberg & Sæther, 2022). Our lived soundworlds are an integrated dimension of our real-world application of social acceleration theory, as the learning paths in folk music are impacted by a multiplicity of societal issues. As Rosa suggests, the concepts of alienation and resonance help us as researchers and teachers set out our positions as transparent and creative, for "What we need, I believe, are approaches that flesh out theory in accordance with what really goes on in our social lives and our societies here and now; and which address our actual experiences" (Rosa in Schiermer, 2020,

---

[3] Caution is needed to keep reverberation as artographical rendering separate from resonance as offered by Rosa (2018). In some texts (Gouzouasis, 2013; Robinson, 2022) reverberation and resonance are mentioned as a pair, with resonance taken to be coupled with reverberation. In artographic texts that use Rosa's concept (2019) of resonance, this distinction must be made. In the present article, resonance refers to Rosa's definition (2018). Reverberation explicitly refers to the artographic rendering.

[4] A spelman (lit. playman) is a musician (professional or not) who performs traditional Swedish music. The gendered component of the title is sometimes highlighted by using the term spelkvinna (lit. playwoman) for women. A spelmanslag (lit. playmen's group) is a fiddle group.

p. 7). Our methodological discussion is one such attempt. The theoretical framing of this article is designed to encourage reflection on the dimension(s) of time, art, and quality in academic work and how they relate to artographic work.

We have structured the article to emphasise the significance of resonance. Having described our ongoing TIL project, we set out the axes of resonance and acceleration in academia. We detail our work as aspiring artographers (*sans* punctuation) in the TIL project, and conclude with suggestions for a toolbox for resonant, sustainable work in academic settings.

TIL and would-be artographers

> A/r/tography is a research methodology, a creative practice, and a performative pedagogy that live in the rhizomatic practices of the liminal in-between. (Irwin, 2004, p. 2)

Our ongoing TIL project explores the learning arenas for Swedish folk music, a musical tradition in which we are personally embedded. They range from its formal arenas to informal ones, from music academies (performance programmes), and folk high schools (full-time and distance courses) to fiddle groups, the professional folk music scene, and regular jam sessions. Although they come under the broad umbrella of Swedish folk music and are interdependent and overlapping, they all have their own features in terms of mutual engagement, joint enterprise, and shared repertoire. This is best articulated using the terminology of communities of practice (Wenger, 1998), while the theoretical framework calls attention to the distinctions and similarities (Tullberg & Sæther, 2022).

We have used our respective communities as a flautist (Tullberg) and fiddler (Sæther) to gather data. Alongside the project's participant observations and interviews in specific learning arenas, we have continued as active participants in folk music contexts as an artist, teacher, and postdoc researcher (Tullberg) and as an emerita professor, academic supervisor, and member of Storösterlens spelmanslag (Sæther), the latter being a folk music orchestra that takes a creative approach to local community celebrations and archive material alike.

Resonance and alienation

The TIL project's schedule is adaptable and the timeframe for completing a certain number of publications is not rigid. A factor in this is that it is a side project we work on in our spare time, in addition to our other academic responsibilities. This has inspired us – and made it possible – to reflect on the epistemological consequences of working at uncontrolled speed, and respond not necessarily by working slower, but more resonantly. Resonance should be understood against the background of Rosa's earlier project (2010), which describes modernity as a social formation based on continual, accelerating growth. Such social structures lead to alienation – a world which for Rosa (2018, p. 1) is colourless and numb. The alternative to a silent, closed world is resonance: a state of mind that invites slowing down, allowing knowledge to expand (Rosa, 2019). It can be found in the arts, but above all it is the opposite of alienation.

In earlier research projects, we have asked about attitudes to learning, intercultural music education, collaborative research methods, the affordances of musical instruments, and folk music education (Sæther, 2003, 2015, 2019; Tullberg, 2017, 2018, 2021, 2022). With resonance as the common denominator in our research, which involves instruments such as the flute, kora, and fiddle, the TIL project continues to be an instrumental space, though we have taken the time to develop a theoretical framework to support our activities. We thus find ourselves as aspiring artographers *and* advocates of a sustainable, resonant lifestyle in academia.

Three axes of resonance

Developing his idea, Rosa (2019) describes three axes of resonance which work together in ordinary life: the horizontal, diagonal, and the vertical.

On the horizontal axis are personal relationships with family, friends, and communities. This is the sphere in which identity and values are shaped, and where the focus is on social institutions and interactions that are "systematically geared toward calculation and accounting" (p. 219), which undermine subjects' capacity for resonance. Along the horizontal axis, politics is conceptualised from de-emotionalised to resonant. Whether a vote cast or a form of music, democracy here transcends legal claims and conflicts between opposing interests, and "rather refers to an ongoing process of becoming more sensitive to a variety of voices in the sense of perspectives, modes of existence and relationships to the world" (p. 218). When

conceptualising school on the horizontal axis, the relationship between teacher and learner is described as the teacher working as "a first tuning fork, i.e. as a source of inspiration and momentum" (p. 246).

The diagonal axis is for people's relationships with objects, workplaces, and school. This is the axis for goal-oriented activities, and where the teacher's role is described as "making the world resound" (p. 243) for students by making the material speak to them, and in so doing they "encounter it anew themselves" (p. 243).

On the vertical axis are transcendental experiences in the "higher" dimensions of life, whether art, religion, or nature. Rosa defines religious experience as a "responsive world that touches us, and that we are capable of meeting in turn" (p. 260). It follows that art and religion are closely related, because "Art touches and moves the inmost souls of modern human beings as recipients like nothing else" (p. 280), and by doing so, can be used by producers of art (artists or creators of art) as a countervoice to "instrumental, political or economic reason" (p. 280). Cultural practices are central to establishing spheres of resonance – "what art does is to allow the possibility of resonant relationships to shine forth in the midst of alienated conditions" (p. 292) – hence the role of higher music education or different musical genres. Rosa describes the resonant relationships between artists and audience as defining the sound and colour of the word, giving shape to collective forms of experiencing the world. In performance practices such as jam sessions or open-ended improvisations, the aesthetic material is plainly open to the emergence of social spheres of resonance. However, it is also possible that artistic expression remains mute, in the sense of inaccessible and alienating. Wherever the context is dominated by social indifference and repulsion, collective practices can lead to alienation.

Reflecting on the axes of resonance to which people are drawn, Rosa (2018) argues it is the task of education to provide the space and time for resonant experiences. Axes of resonance may be a fruitful way of bringing about a "resonant mode of being" (p. 5) and, we would argue, a sustainable way of producing new knowledge.

Acceleration in higher music education

Embedded in modern society, academia is not spared from acceleration (Vostal, 2016). The academic discipline of music education is no exception, and neither are our own academic environments. The effects of acceleration in academia are diverse

and include the rhythm of work. Vostal (2016) reports the lack of undisturbed, uninterrupted time as a general problem highlighted by his interviewees. Academics must deal with a complicated work situation. Vostal (2016) identifies three ways his respondents in variety of disciplines treat an increasing workload: juggling, wrestling, and resenting.

Vostal's jugglers (2016), though not enjoying time pressure per se, saw a swift pace and, by extension, a professional mindset as integral to academic life. As one of his informants put it, "For me, the key part of being an academic is to be able to keep up with the [fast] information flow. (…) It is about processing information" (p. 130). Among the wrestlers, time pressure and a heavy workload make for a structural predicament, but one which can successfully be dealt with on an individual level with the correct strategies. However, the costs are explicitly articulated, with one informant saying that prioritising always comes down to choosing who to let down. The informants who resent acceleration describe their estrangement and despair about their own work situation and the academic climate. They talk of having to cut corners, not only in mundane administrative tasks, but in their own research. Reading the results of Vostal's inquiry (2016), a fourth group presents itself: people who burn out or leave academia altogether and are not part of the study. With this fourth group in mind, we posit that resonant, artographic work habits might help prevent academic brain drain.

Rosa (2018) applies his sociology to education, but also to working conditions. We often see the same problematic symptoms in our ordinary academic work:

> [T]he pervasive bureaucratic attempts to completely control processes and outcomes in order to ensure their efficiency and transparency, which define late modern workplace conditions, are equally problematic for relationships of resonance, because they are incompatible with the latter's unpredictability and transformative potential. (Rosa, 2018, p. 5)

One of these attempts to control efficiency is bibliometrics:

> While the amount of scientific output is ballooning, science and research has long ceased to take place in the unobserved cocoon of the scientific ivory tower, but rather on the social battlefield in the war for money, honour and recognition. (Ball, 2018, p. 4)

Bibliometrics track a scholar's publications and citations, but only indirectly does it measure research quality, with impact gauged using citation metrics as the proxy.

A growing body of research about the *corporate university* underlines the necessity of time to think (Giroux, 2009), the importance of collegiality (Hall, 2007), the time needed to defend democracy (Nussbaum, 2010), the dangers of the "McUniversity" (Parker & Jay, 1995), the consequences of a fractured faculty culture (Wilson, 2013), and the importance of a slow approach (Glenn, 2021). Alvesson et al. (2022) bring a historical perspective in their treatment of the tension between competition-driven research production and genuine intellectual pursuits. Although modernity served as a catalyst, the issue was sufficiently pressing for Schiller to remark on it in 1789 in his inaugural lecture as professor of history at the University of Jena, in a disquisition on the philosophical mind and the *Brotgelehrte* – two academic archetypes driven by intellectual curiosity on the one hand and careerism on the other.

Building on their own experiences as much as the literature, Berg and Seeber (2017) introduce the concept of the *slow professor*, the antithesis of the *Brotgelehrte*. The slow professor makes time for reflection and dialogue and insists on open-ended inquiry as one of the cornerstones of academic work. The slow professor "takes back the intellectual life of the university" (p. xviii). The mounting interest in productivity, efficiency, and competition at the corporate university risks turning even the most collegial of initiatives into measurable commodities. However, acceleration in academic life is not only a question of personal well-being and avoiding burnout; acceleration and competitiveness have negative structural effects on the value of the work being done (Berg & Seeber, 2017).

The temporality of the corporate university does more than contribute to personal stress; it also undermines the democratic potential of the university to encourage people to engage critically with and for the world (Berg & Seeber, 2017). The slow professor's slow is to be understood as an alternative to a world without sound and colour and academic cultures with no time for engaged, collaborative reflection. Given this acceleration, it is our sense from our TIL project that temporality is of vital importance for artographic work, and hence for the implications of artographic work in music education contexts.

Artography and music education

Although artography is part of a postmodern paradigm, its main concerns have a long history. The perennial questions of forms of knowing were treated by Aristotle, who outlined an epistemology centred on *theoria*, *praxis*, and *poesis* (Irwin, 2004). While some academic disciplines might gravitate towards the first of the three forms of knowing, we would argue that art education should embrace them all. Artography promises to highlight, improve, and merge the same forms of knowing, both in a structural and an individual sense.

Irwin (2004) suggests that "The roles of artist–researcher–teacher often cause inner struggles as individuals attempt to carry the weight of disciplinary traditions and achievements while experimenting with and creating new forms of knowing, doing, and making" (p. 30). Embedded in the foundations of artography is an ambition to find new ways of working in academia, as is sorely needed.

Artography can take many forms (Irwin & Cosson, 2004) and methodological orthodoxy is not its end goal. However, there are certain central elements which hold artography together, beyond a keen interest in merging all the various forms of knowing, doing, and making. The postmodern paradigm of which artography is part offers idiomatic modes of inquiry called *renderings*.

> To render, to give, to present, to perform, to become – offers for action, the opportunity for living inquiry. Research that breathes. Research that listens. Renderings are not methods. They are not lists of verbs initiated to create an arts-based or a/r/tographical study. Renderings are theoretical spaces through which to explore artistic ways of knowing and being research. (Springgay et al., 2005, p. 899)

Among these theoretical spaces are living inquiry, contiguity, metaphor, openings, reverberations, and excess (Lasczik et al., 2022). However, though renderings are described in terms of spaces, they can all inspire action. Ultimately, artography can be thought of as an open-ended way of being and becoming. This open-endedness is reflected in its rhizomatic nature, with multiple vantage points and no clear end or beginning – a structure which may seem challenging in today's academia, which so often relies on projects with clearly articulated goals.

Irwin (2013) argues that artography is a research inquiry, a pedagogical strategy, and a creative activity and that all three forms of knowing are valued. Her study of practices in art education shows that artography can be a strategy for both student and teacher learning. She singles out four commitments that characterise artographic work: a commitment to inquiry; a commitment to a way of being in the world; a commitment to negotiating personal engagement in a community of belonging; and a commitment to creating practices that address difference (p. 201).

As already noted, when considering alienation as the opposite of resonance (Rosa, 2022) and academic brain drain (Vostal, 2016), more holistic approaches to pedagogical, artistic, and scholarly practice are needed. The field of artography encompasses a range of stances. Heaton et al. (2022), for example, state that "engagement facilitates interaction with change agendas and moves learners away from neo-liberal apathy" (p. 55). In arguing for an artography combined with pedagogical work, Illeris et al. (2022) claim that such initiatives create "a room to think about and play with research" (p. 56).

A more radical, musical position is proposed by Robinson (2022), who argues for the removal of the punctuation from a/r/tography to make it artography. A move which we embrace, that was first proposed by Gouzouasis (2013) to accentuate the holistic nature of the creative processes associated with research and teaching (see also Yanko, 2021). Robinson (2022) uses artographic concepts and approaches to study the formation of music teachers' professional identity, but as a musician herself she finds it difficult to embrace the conceptual framework, and in her lived experience she finds the punctuation disturbing, even irrelevant. She also notes that artography has only a few examples of music researchers, so that musical perspectives are missing from discussions of renderings or performance: "For a long time I skirted around artography, but as a musician I was troubled by that space. At first, I thought it was exclusively for visual artist–researcher–teachers" (p. 37). In time – and by enlarging on artographic renderings from a musician's perspective – Robinson can describe artographic work as an "obvious choice" (p. 38), although she notes that few musicians–teachers–researchers seem to have the courage to work in these conceptual spaces (examples include Gouzouasis, 2007, 2013; Bakan, 2014). For artography to be an obvious choice for musicians–teachers–researchers, Robinson (2022) suspects the strict regimes in traditional conservatoire settings will have to be

relaxed. Musicians need to "re-configure our self-perception of what it means to be an artist to enable participation in this conceptual space" (p. 39).

Removing the punctuation from artography also highlights the potential problem in requiring artists, researchers, and teachers to work even harder in their three (distinct) careers. The three roles are structurally separate as each creates (seemingly) different forms of value (artistic creations; knowledge production and distribution; learning and striving students) and different measures of success. As structural preconditions, these measurements uphold the boundaries between the roles. Those working in higher music education, however, have the opportunity to entwine the three roles in pedagogical activities that retain their artographic awareness. Alert to such possibilities, we turn to music as a social, material, and aesthetic art form, with its unique way of setting the three axes of resonance in motion.

Being-in-a-music-world and musically being in the world

> I have come to understand that paying attention is not about shining a spotlight on this or that object in the world, but going along with things, opening up to them and doing their bidding. (Ingold, 2022, p. 128)

As aspiring musical artographers, musical practice is for us a central way of being in the world, and, as such, a mode of exploration in research. We think of musical practice in a broad, socially grounded sense – what Small (1998) calls *musicking*. Small (1998) asks us to rethink music as a verb rather than a noun, an activity rather than an object. Musicking is a relational and meaning-making activity, and thus provides a modality of resonance along the horizontal axis, as it exists in social communities (Kenny, 2016; Tullberg & Sæther, 2022). However, musical practice is also clearly material, and so at home on the diagonal axis. Similarly, research is not a disembodied practice (Bresler, 2005) – we can only agree that both perception and cognition are embodied –just as people are not disembodied practices, or as Ingold (2022) rightly puts it, "we are inhabitants not of our bodies, but of a world. The body, with its organs of sense, affords an opening to this world, not a means of separation: it offers exposure, not immunity" (p. 105). As musicians we are at one with our instruments because of our sensorimotor relationship with them (Tullberg, 2022), and hence our instruments are integral to of our "being-in-the-music-world" (Nilsson, 2011, p. 144) and part of our "somatic mode of attention" (Bresler, 2005, p. 177).

Thus, our musical instruments are sometimes agents in the research situation (Tullberg, 2021; Sæther, 2015). We are being in the world, musically. From this follows an attunement to sounds that as researchers we draw on in interviews and observations: empathic observation and listening in interviews, similar to the engaged way we listen to music by being open, present, alert to nuanced qualities, interpretive, and leaving evaluation to a later stage (Bresler, 2005).

In the same vein as Rosa's use (2019) of the metaphor of resonance, Bresler (2005) discusses research processes through musical concepts. Musical performance, she says, "focuses on the music to be played, drawing on the inner resources of the performer, and addressed to the audience" (p. 178). Similarly, a researcher has a three-pronged approach, reaching for the object of study, the inner self unravelling the subjectivities and values, and the target audience. Bresler also draws on the part played by improvisation in music and research, for, "rather than being an unpredictable act as it is sometimes regarded, [it] involves a responsiveness […] to an unpredictable reality" (p. 174). She goes on to claim that improvisation has been neglected in the canon of Western art music and is similarly overlooked by traditional research methods.

Yet the improvisational, performative aspect of method is central to messy research (Law, 2004). Research methods, just as much as theoretical perspectives, are always selective and amplify certain aspects of reality, or even produce realities (Law, 2004). Drawing on Latour and Wolgar, Law concludes

> Contrary to Euro-American common sense, they [Latour and Wolgar] are telling us that it is not possible to separate out (a) the making of particular *realities*, (b) the making of particular *statements* about those realities, and (c) the creation of *instrumental*, *technical and human configurations and practices*, the inscription devices that produce the realities and statements. Instead, *all are produced together*. (Law 2004, p. 31, original emphasis)

Just as research can be understood as performative, its output can be performed. As part of the TIL project, the Skåne folk music trios Jidder (of which Tullberg is part) and Hialøsa explored what the geographical space of Skåne and its musical tradition meant for them as individual musicians and as ensembles. The exploration was also performed as a recital and open discussion at a conference (Tullberg et al., 2022).

Experiences from the TIL project continually and less explicitly contribute to our individual teaching practices. For example, when supervising doctoral students, Sæther introduces future researchers and teachers to networks so they can create their own all-important axes of resonance with researchers at many educational institutions with a multiplicity of disciplinary perspectives. As aspiring artographers working in a longitudinal project and taking the slow professor approach (Berg & Seeber, 2017), the risk seems to be that the premise of accelerated academic culture has a dampening effect on resonant work. On the horizontal axis of resonance, though, our collaborative work and active engagement in our respective communities is a source of inspiration and contributes to critical reinterpretations of our data as it is collected. On the diagonal axis of resonance, our playing and relationship with our instruments provides ways of knowing that include the material dimension of music education.

TIL is an open project and we can relate to the description of artographic researchers as "unable to come to conclusions or to settle into a linear pattern of inquiry. […] Living inquiry refuses absolutes; rather, it engages with a continual process of not-knowing, of searching for meaning that is difficult and in tension" (Springgay et al., 2005, s. 902). A rhizomatic process of not-knowing creates a heightened state of attention and, we would argue, an openness to resonance. It is the conditions of this rejection of absolutes to which we now turn.

Discussion: Resonance for real

> [W]e need to re-configure our self-perception of what it means to be an 'artist' to enable participation in this conceptual space. (Robinson, 2022, p. 39)

Returning to the question of what Rosa's concept (2018) of resonance means to us as aspiring artographers, we are in a position to say we interpret resonance as a profound construct which can be held as a unifying, guiding principle, giving forward direction to our lives, whether professional or private. Sustaining resonance in academia calls for reflection on how to organise one's scholarly work life, hence our interest here in the tools and constraints on this task. At first glance – and in our current work life – we can see how the artographer's roles intersect with the three axes of resonance.

As researchers, we typically find ourselves engaged in research projects consisting of goal-oriented, purposeful activities revolving around a diagonal axis. The timeline is fixed, as is the form of output. As teachers we experience resonance along a horizontal axis as we build relationships with students, in both group lessons and one-to-one tuition. Although we follow a set curriculum, with fixed procedures for examinations, the primary focus is the trust we build with one another and the knowledge we create together. As musicians we strive for experiences that spiral along the vertical axis. Although we know both social and material aspects to be important to our artistic practice, the aesthetic experiences we achieve through music making are unattainable in our other roles.

The TIL project offers a solution to this disconnect. It is a case study in how to wrestle with acceleration in academia (Vostal, 2016) by adopting an artographic, "messy" (Law, 2004) way of working. As the next step in dissolving, or at least blurring, the boundaries between the roles of artist, teacher, and researcher, we consider the TIL project through the core renderings of artography. By examining how the boundaries between roles can be negotiated, we arrive at a useful toolbox of principles.

TIL, renderings, and resonances
Like Robinson (2022) and (Lasczik et al., 2022), we understand renderings to be theoretical spaces that inspire action and as "conceptual organizers to understand significant qualities during the creative process" (p. 1062).

Openings are possible encounters between identities and artworks; spaces where the fabric of the process is torn apart to allow experiences from seemingly different aspects of life to entwine. In our case, this is possible because of the open-ended character of the TIL project. Unlike any other research project, we have been involved with, its flexible timeline and continual engagement in the musical scene studied means we experience our roles as teachers and researchers as merging. Rather than a typically instrumental, linear, and hierarchical research process, TIL allows for the slow emergence of a rhizomatic structure. There is no start and no end to the project, because it is one with our being-in-the-music-world.

This state – in a way a loss of control – is linked to the construct of excess. Given that each new experience reframes and casts light on earlier experiences, inside and outside of the formal TIL project, there is an ungraspable amount of connections

between data and theory, and between the empirical material and our affective responses to it. Sæther's participation in the fiddle group and Tullberg's work with the Ralsgård & Tullberg quartet are examples of how our lives reflect the TIL project and vice versa. As an ever-unfolding process, it can never be pinned down in a final analysis. What is left are fragments of a snapshot: moments such as this article, the writing of which generates new strands of the rhizome.

Forward movement, dwelling between the spaces in identities, between tangent concepts, and between different forms of action (such as writing this article during the day and performing music in the evening) is discussed using the rendering of *contiguity*. Here we find the academic milieu a challenge. Only by deliberately restructuring given formats can contiguity be upheld in the academic setting. An example of this was the seminar organised by Sæther, at which Jidder's lecture recital was an integrated part of the flow.

We have changed in various regards over the course of the TIL project, reflecting the rendering of living inquiry. The most obvious change is because TIL serves as a threshold project: Tullberg has progressed from graduate to postdoc researcher, Sæther from professor to emerita. As we have moved through the intended messiness of the project design, we have learned to use our different and sometimes conflicting roles. As a fiddler, Sæther senses how artographic aspirations are expressed in more thoughtful, holistic playing styles, while Tullberg in his role as a flute teacher deliberately moves between all three roles of artist, teacher, and researcher. As researchers, we both sense that the rendering of living inquiry contributes to a growing confidence when designing and doing research that suits our field, sometimes outside the expected frames.

Within the space of *reverberation,* we enjoy the ringing resonances that occur as sonorities from the artographic spaces meet and embrace one another, suggesting movement between the new and the already established. For example, when interviewing folk musicians in different contexts, we immerse ourselves in the same musical activities: improvisations in jam sessions in urban settings; organised, intergenerational group teaching at an adult education centre. The concept of reverberance makes us aware of musical experiences that risk getting lost in more strict research contexts.

The rendering of metaphor is overarching, as it covers being, telling, existence, and explanation in making knowledge available to the senses. For Robinson (2022), this function of metaphor is one of the key arguments for removing the punctuation from artography. For us, we feel a *polska* (a dance) as a "blue sausage" (Tullberg, 2021, p. 116) or as strings reaching out to fiddling fingers, which is something we try to put into words in our research output. The use of metaphor has a central place in music education in many cultures around the globe (Schippers, 2006). When successfully used by teachers, metaphor creates a cognitive dissonance which helps students reorganise their approach to the music they strive to master or to view a piece of music from another angle. Still, the work done by metaphor in everyday musical practice is rarely made explicit. By thinking of metaphor as an artographic construct, it directs attention to this tool of creative befuddlement. Schippers (2006) puts it nicely: "However much curricula suggest a definable, controlled development towards musical excellence, no musician should be led to believe that music is an art that can be learned and performed without confusion in pride of place" (p. 214).

Resonance as a unifying, guiding principle promises synergies, where the three roles/axes conflate and strengthen one another more clearly than is often the case in our present lives. Although an artographic approach can be the path to a more holistic lifestyle, the structural preconditions constrain forward movement.

Negotiating the boundaries
We engage in the TIL project from different positions. Sæther is retired and has no need to add to her list of publications. Tullberg is navigating career paths that according to Bresler (2022) in the worst-case scenario could lead to getting damped in academia.

Bibliometrics, the statistical analysis of publications and citations, only indirectly measures research quality. What we acknowledge in our commitment to living inquiry is that giving space to our own engagement as community members in the folk music genre will lead to other outputs than those listed in our university's public database of research, the Lund University Research Portal. Our own profiles give an overview in numbers of how much we have produced: this many articles and essays, that many research projects, and so on, all highlighted. The presentation is strikingly similar to sports statistics such as NHL or NFL stats, bringing to mind Berg and Seeber's observation that by "Rebranding scholars as key players in the knowledge economy,

the corporate university emphasizes instrumentalism and marketability" (2017, p. 53). Yet there are dimensions the figures fail to convey, and bibliometrics requires expert interpretation, while the raw data is useless to administrators or academic leaders who do not have in-depth knowledge of the particular discipline (Sahel, 2011). Meanwhile, as Berg and Seeber (2017) have it, the slow professor is busy building collegiality and community. There is good reason to highlight the importance of collaborative work: research shows that a lack of collegiality is "detrimental to professional development" (p. 77).

Academics struggle with shortage of time (Vostal, 2016; Berg & Seeber, 2017). This is often (as in our case) because of a plethora of teaching, research, and administration obligations. Artistic pursuits, however, are most often not included in their daily tasks, except where they might overlap with instrumental tuition. The shortage of time is a perennial constraint because "genuine slowdown can be possible only if the global capitalist economic system collapses" (Vostal, 2016, p. 197). Therefore, a more relevant question is how to manage time, or here how to maximise temporal autonomy (Vostal, 2016). As Rosa (2019) notes, there can be pleasure in speed and it surely has its place. For us, certain work sessions, especially at Sæther's home, are associated with a highly concentrated state of mind, where we experience a sense of flow and speed. Others, though, are slower, more reflective, and tentative, trying to make sense of the messy research process (Law, 2004). These phases could be rushed, but the research would be different. In the climate of efficiency, any public acknowledgement that it takes time to plan, conduct, process, write up, and publish a piece of substantial academic research is tantamount to "acts of everyday rebellion" (Berg & Seeber, 2017, p. 56). This is especially important in environments where the leadership and administration have no experience of research themselves.

The open research approach in our artographic exploration of what is at stake in becoming a folk musician, makes it possible to negotiate our personal engagement in the "community of belonging" (Irwin, 2013, p. 201) we are studying. During the research process we have experienced both how the communities themselves create troubling practices and how we, in our academic endeavours, need to address the commitment to inquiry as a "way of being in the world" (Irwin, 2013, p. 201).

The inclusive, holistic didactics that predominate in learning situations at adult education centres are profoundly different to the one-to-one tuition of the teaching strategies that characterise higher music education. As the genre of folk music has been included in academic institutions, "troubling" practices emerge in the different learning settings, depending on the context. It is our experience that there is an overlap between the studied contexts; both teachers and students move between formal and informal learning settings, thus moving the genre ahead and preventing stagnation. The differences in teaching and learning styles prompt creative adaptations, such as introducing more oral transmission in academic settings or exploring notation as a potential learning tool in informal, normally notation-free folk music learning situations.

While we have seen the agents in the folk music arenas in question creating troubling practices, we ourselves experience the "commitment to inquiry" (Irwin, 2013, p. 201) as problematic, for example when trying to squeeze the TIL project into frames defined by how much time is allocated for research–teaching–musicianship in academic positions, or when fitting our project to the demands of ethical approval routines predicated on fixed research processes. In our collaboration, however, we have found that insisting on staying in the unsafe zone that comes from practicing *messy research* (Law, 2004, p. 2) transforms the threat of getting stuck into the chance of "getting lost" (Sæther, 2021, p.25). The collaborative writing, analysis, and development of practical outcomes in the TIL research project have all contributed to enlarging and developing the vertical axes of resonance, inspiring us to find new ways to develop communities in our academic context. Collaboration and slow work (Berg & Seeber, 2017) thus have a place in any artographer's resonance toolbox.

The collaborative dimension is integral to the TIL project. One way of keeping the resonance sustained is through ensemble research (Bresler, 2005), in which the three-pronged approach mentioned above is expanded to a four-pronged approach. Another form of collaboration is to organise seminars, or why not a career workshop about how to work in academia as a philosophical mind rather than a *Brotgelehrte*, and even the trade-off between the roles that academics negotiate with the system and the leadership (Alvesson et al., 2022).

The TIL project's process has prompted us to use our musical experiences for research purposes. Although it can be described as opportunistic participant

observation (Adler & Adler, 1987), it leads to a way of working that extends beyond such methodological labels. Rather, we see that the analytical mindset has become part of our perception of the world. Although this is probably true for many scholars, we would argue there is more to it than first meets the eye. Carrying notebooks, collecting brochures, and asking searching questions are artographers' habits (in general we find people are happy to share their views on topics they hold dear). It is not data gathering; it is shaping a more nuanced version of the reality created by the research process (Law, 2004).

An artographer is well placed to share their own and others' research with the artistic communities of which they are part. In Tullberg's case, there are invitations to give talks and recitals or to moderate panel discussions alongside his engagement as a musician, which would not have happened were it not for his role as an artist (as a musician). In Sæther's case, distance learning at an adult education centre (as a co-learner) is paving the way for the wordless experience of sharing tunes and searching for individual artistic expression in a circle of engaged practitioners. Apart from lessons, it is the nightly jam sessions and philosophical discussions about the folk music identity which contribute to the data analysis. Introducing theoretical concepts such as resonance are an injection of energy into the informal negotiations of meaning in a folk music setting. The reverse is true as well, since an artographer has a legitimate mandate to include artistic presentations in academia. For us, this is exemplified by presentations accompanied by musical demonstrations or the above-mentioned symposium with the Jidder and Hialøsa trios. We believe such modes of presentation should not be limited to autoethnographic or artistic research, which, although sometimes overlapping with artographic research, is different.

Another path forward would be to create specific projects that clearly overlap and build on each other (López-Peláez-Casellas & García-Herrera, 2019). Taken the article about Tullberg's instrumental teaching practice (2017), designed to capture how a teacher of traditional music negotiates conditions in academia. While it focuses on students' artistic freedom, it still came as a surprise to find students were using the same article as a guide to how to work on the interpretation of tunes. While Tullberg included sheet music and sound files to support the written analysis, students instead took these as the primary object of interest. We see the potential here to intentionally shape publications to do a dual job and so close the gap between theory and practice.

Finally, we would also argue that slow processes that explicitly draw on the three roles of the artographer can produce output of better quality than otherwise would be the case. Competition and unsafe appointments result in a publications race, which may lead to unoriginal research output which aspires to nothing more than to fill a gap in the literature – a gap that may not need filling (Alvesson et al., 2022). We hope the approach described here will lead to a holistic view on knowledge production with a more profound impact than bibliometric virtuosity.

Outro

In this article we argue that by bringing together Rosa's concept of resonance (2018) and an artographic approach to academic work, we see a way to dissolve the boundaries between the roles of artist, researcher, and teacher. We suggest the following toolbox for future progress: (*i*) develop an theoretical awareness of resonant work, which can inspire artographers to (*ii*) keep an analytical mindset in everyday life; (*iii*) initiate and commit to deep, collaborative projects; (*iv*) take research findings to the artistic community when the opportunity arises; (*v*) insist on making art an integral part of research activities and presentations; (*vi*) create projects where the three artographic roles intersect; and (*vii*) walk the talk, doing research that matters to the local environment. Although our discussion and the resultant toolbox are based on our own experiences, we hope many academics in other but similar positions can use our suggestions. As a unifying, resilient principle, we find Rosa's work provides a robust theoretical framework for artographic projects. It also provides a strong argument for artographic approaches in academic work, because it shows the centrality of art in a relational perspective. Researchers, or rather artographers, could reinforce the subjective modality in the research output that Law (2004) is concerned about. Metaphors are central to the artographic approach (Springgay et al., 2005), and Rosa's extrapolation on the resonance metaphor is congenial with its methodological underpinnings.

About the authors

Markus Tullberg is a flute player, teacher and researcher. He has pioneered the revitalization of the wooden transverse flute in Swedish folk music and released a number of albums with his ensembles, in particular together with Andreas Ralsgård. As a researcher, he has explored topics such as materiality, embodied cognition, and the nature of artistic expression within music education.

Eva Sæther is a fiddle player and researcher. She has served as a teacher at Malmö Academy of Music, where she developed and carried out several educational projects, for example the "Gambia course", aiming at providing future musicians and music teachers with competence needed in intercultural contexts. As a researcher she has a special interest in intercultural perspectives in music education, radical empiricism and sensuous scholarship.

References

Adler, P. & Adler, P. (1987). *Membership Roles in Field Research.* Sage. doi.org/10.4135/9781412984973

Alvesson, M., Einola, K. & Schaefer, S. (2022). Philosophical Minds or Brotgelehrte? *Organization Studies*, *43*(11), 1839–1852. doi.org/10.1177/0170840621989002

Bakan, D. (2014). *A song of songs: A/r/tography, autoethnography, and songwriting as music education research* [Doctoral thesis, University of British Columbia].

Ball, R. (2018). *An introduction to bibliometrics. New development and trends.* Chandos.

Berg, M. & Seeber, B. K. (2017). *The Slow Professor: Challenging the Culture of Speed in Academy*. University of Toronto Press.

Bjerstedt, S. (2021). *Storytelling in Jazz and Musicality in Theatre: Through the Mirror.* Routledge. doi.org/10.4324/9780429457883

Bresler, L. (2005). What musicianship can teach educational research. *Music Education Research 7*(2), 169–183. doi.org/10.1080/14613800500169399

Bresler, L. (2022). The form, rhythm, and orchestration of an academic career: Cultivating and navigating inner compasses within institutional terrains. *Research Studies in Music Education 44*(1), 5–20. doi.org/10.1177/1321103X211036327

Dissanayake, E. (1992). *Homo aestheticus: Where art comes from and why.* Free Press.

Giroux, H. A. (2009). The Attack on Higher Education and the Necessity of Critical Pedagogy. In S. L. Macrine (Ed.), *Critical Pedagogy in Uncertain Times: Hopes and Possibilities* (pp. 11–26). Palgrave. doi.org/10.1057/9780230100893_2

Glenn, M. (2021). Extending knowledge by developing a 'slow approach' to action research. *Educational Action Research*, *31*(3), 592–607. doi.org/10.1080/09650792.2021.1948434

Gouzouasis, P. (2007). Music in an a/r/tographic tonality. *Journal of the Canadian Association for Curriculum Studies*, *5*(2), 33–38. doi.org/10.25071/1916-4467.17042

Gouzouasis, P. (2013). The metaphor of tonality in artography. *UNESCO Observatory Multi Disciplinary Journal in the Arts: E-journal*, *3*(1), 1–18.

Hall. D.E. (2007). *The Academic Community: A Manual for Change*. Ohio State University Press.

Heaton, R., Burnard, P. & Nikolova, A. (2020). Artography as creative pedagogy: A living inquiry with professional doctoral students. *Australian Art Education*, *41*(1), 53–74.

Illeris, H., Nødtvendt Knudsen, K. & Skregelid, L. (2022). A/r/tografi som tilgang til udvikling af en sanselig bæredygtighedsdidaktik i kunstfagene. *Nordic Journal of Art & Research*, *11*(1). doi.org/10.7577/information.5067

Ingold, T. (2022). *Imagining for real: Essays on creation, attention and correspondence.* Routledge. doi.org/10.4324/9781003171713

Irwin, R.L. (2004). A/r/tography: A metonymic métissage. In R.L. Irwin & A. De Cosson (Eds.) *A/r/tography: Rendering self through arts-based living inquiry* (pp. 27-40). Pacific Educational Press.

Irwin, R. L. (2013). Becoming A/r/tography. *Studies in Art Education*, *54*(3), 198–215. doi.org/10.1080/00393541.2013.11518894

Irwin, R. & Cosson, A. (2004). *A/r/tography: Rendering Self through Arts-Based Living Inquiry*. Pacific Educational Press.

Kenny, A. (2016). *Communities of musical practice.* Ashgate. doi.org/10.4324/9781315572963

Lasczik, A., Hotko, K., Cutter-Mackenzie-Knowles, A. & McGahey, T. (2022). Propositional A/r/tography: An Analytical Protocol. *Qualitative Inquiry*, *28*(10), 1062–1076. doi.org/10.1177/10778004221093418

Lave, J. & Wenger, E. (1991). *Situated learning: Legitimate peripheral participation.* Cambridge University Press. doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511815355

Law, J. (2004). *After method. Mess in social science research*. Routledge.

López-Peláez-Casellas, M. P. & García-Herrera, C. (2019). An artistic research proposal from an a/r/tography perspective: A study of the first movement of

Strauss's oboe concerto. *Revista Música Hodie*, *19*, 1–12.
doi.org/10.5216/mh.v19.54873

Nilsson, P.-A. (2011). *A Field of Possibilities: Designing and Playing Digital Musical Instruments*. Göteborg Universitet.

Nussbaum, M. (2010). *Not for Profit: Why Democracy Needs the Humanities.* Princeton University Press.

Parker, M. & Jary, D. (1995). The McUniversity: Organization, Management and Academic Subjectivity. *Organization 2*(2), 319–338.
doi.org/10.1177/135050849522013

Robinson, P. (2022). Conceptual Questing: A doctoral methodological journey to music artography (a/r/tography). *Victorian Journal of Music Education*, 32–41.

Rosa, H. (2010). *Alienation and Acceleration: Towards a Critical Theory of Late-Modern Temporality.* Aarhus University Press.

Rosa, H. (2015). *The theory of social acceleration*. Columbia University Press.

Rosa, H. (2018). The Idea of Resonance as a Sociological Concept. *Global Dialogue: Magazine of the International Sociological Association*, *8*(2), 9 July. http://globaldialogue.isa-sociology.org/articles/the-idea-of-resonance-as-a-sociological-concept

Rosa, H. (2019). *Resonance. A Sociology of Our Relationships to the World.* Polity Press.

Sahel, J.-A. (2011). Quality Versus Quantity: Assessing Individual Research Performance. *Science Translational Medicine*, *3*(84).
doi.org/10.1126/scitranslmed.3002249

Sæther, E. (2003). *The Oral University: Attitudes to music teaching and learning in the Gambia.* Malmö Academy of Music.

Sæther, E. (2015). Exploring musical research sensibilities. In L. Bresler (Ed.), *Beyond Methods: Lessons from the Arts to Research Methodology* (pp. 89–104). Malmö Academy of Music. doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-21029-8_5

Sæther, E. (2019). Intercultural game in music teacher education: Exploring El Sistema in Sweden. In H. Westerlund, S. Karlsen & H. Partti (Eds.), *Visions for intercultural music teacher education* (pp. 63-81). Springer.

Sæther, S. (2021). The art(s) of getting lost: Halting places for culturally responsive research methods. In A. Kallio, S. Karlsen, K. Marsh, E. Sæther & H. Westerlund (Eds.), *The Politics of Diversity in Music Education* (pp. 15–27). Routledge. doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-65617-1_2

Schiermer, B. (2020). Acceleration and Resonance: An Interview with Hartmut Rosa: Interviewed by Bjørn Schiermer. *Acta Sociologica, E-Special: Four generations of critical theory in Acta Sociologica.* http://journals.sagepub.com/pb-assets/cmscontent/ASJ/Acceleration_and_Resonance.pdf

Schippers, H. (2006). "As if a Little Bird Is Sitting on Your Finger…": Metaphor as a Key Instrument in Training Professional Musicians. *International Journal of Music Education*, *24*(3), 209–217. doi.org/10.1177/0255761406069640

Sinner, A. (2017). Cultivating researchful dispositions: a review of a/r/tographic scholarship. *Journal of Visual Art Practice*, 16(1), 39–60. 10.1080/14702029.2016.1183408

Small, C. (1998). *Musicking: The Meanings of Performing and Listening.* Wesleyan University Press.

Springgay, S., Irwin, R. L. & Kind, S. W. (2005). A/r/tography as living inquiry through art and text. *Qualitative Inquiry*, *11*(6), 897–912. doi.org/10.1177/1077800405280696

Tullberg, M. (2017). Teaching the Wooden Transverse Flute in Swedish Traditional Music in the Context of Higher Music Education. *Puls: Musik- och Dansetnologisk Tidskrift*, *2*, 26–44.

Tullberg, M. (2018). Meanings of tradition in Swedish folk music education. In B.–W. Leung (Ed.), *Traditional musics in the modern world: Transmission, evolution, and challenges* (pp. 129–139). Springer. doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-91599-9_9

Tullberg, M. (2021). *Wind and Wood: Affordances of Musical Instruments: The Example of the Simple-System Flute.* Musikhögskolan i Malmö, Lunds universitet. doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.974820

Tullberg. M. (2022). Affordances of musical instruments: Conceptual consideration. *Frontiers in Psychology*, *13*. doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.974820

Tullberg, M. & Sæther, E. (2022). Playing with tradition in communities of Swedish folk music: Negotiations of meaning in instrumental music tuition. *Frontiers in Education*, *7*. doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2022.974589

Tullberg, M., Bojlund, M., Hermansson, G., Bosdottir, A. & Zeberg, M. (2022, 8 November). *Musical approaches to tradition: Two folk music ensembles and the historical axis of creativity* [Lecture recital]. Communality & the Arts: Place,

Sustainability and Heritage: Place, Sustainability and Heritage conference, Malmö, Sweden.

Vostal, F. (2016). *Accelerating Academia: The Changing Structure of Academic Time.* Palgrave Macmillan. doi.org/10.1057/9781137473608

Wilson, R. (2013). Faculty Culture is Fractured. *Chronicle of Higher Education*, *59*(40), A24–A27.

Wenger, E. (1998). *Communities of practice: Learning, meaning, and identity.* Cambridge University Press. doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511803932

Yanko, M. (2021). *Living Assessment: The Artful Assessment of Learning in the Arts* [Doctoral thesis, University of British Columbia].